

Co-funded by the Prevention of and Fight against Crime  
Programme of the European Commission



**Combat Trafficking in Human Beings**  
**Literature Review and Industry Context**  
**September 2015**

*This report reflects only the author's views and not those of the European Commission. The European Commission is not responsible for any use that may be made of information contained in this report.*



# **Combat Trafficking in Human Beings**

## **Literature Review and Industry Context**

**Kate Clayton-Hathway**

1. Introduction.....	3
2. Methodology .....	3
3. Background.....	4
4. The hospitality sector in context .....	5
5. Data collection .....	6
6. Difficulties with policing and law enforcement .....	6
7. Trafficking ‘methods’ .....	8
8. Organisations and networks.....	8
9. Medical issues and THB .....	9
10. Women and children.....	10
11. Victim support.....	11
12. Hotels and hospitality research.....	12
13. Guidance for the hospitality industry .....	12
14. Wider policy change .....	14
15. Future research.....	14
Bibliography .....	16

## 1. Introduction

Trafficking of human beings (THB) is a global issue, with no country immune from acting as a country of origin for trafficked persons, as a destination country or one of transit through which they are moved<sup>1</sup>. While much emphasis in the past has been on addressing trafficking of women for sexual exploitation, this has expanded more recently to include forced labour, domestic servitude, and child exploitation, all of which may involve trafficking (Craig, 2014; ILO, 2014). Increasingly, these phenomena are seen collectively as ‘modern slavery’ and are of growing concern to supranational governmental and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) (Mantouvalou, 2010). The tourism industry has been identified as one which can facilitate THB, through use of hotels for sexual exploitation, employment practices which may allow forced or bonded labour and the use of products and services from unethical sources which might include forced or exploited labour (Wilkinson et al, 2010; International Tourism Partnership, 2013). There is evidence that these factors are increasingly important for inclusion within corporate social responsibility strategies in the sector (International Tourism Partnership, 2013; Balch and Rankin, 2014).

The following literature review and industry context aims to provide an overview of research on trafficking within the context of the tourism industry and the hospitality sector more specifically. It identifies the current key policy concerns and areas of academic interest which might inform the development of practical guidance for preventing and mitigating THB in the sector. The literature obtained focuses on Europe, drawing on both academic work and industry literature to give context to the overall COMBAT study.

## 2. Methodology

The literature review comprised an extensive search via both Google search engine and academic databases for academic papers and policy documents relating to ‘trafficking’, ‘modern slavery’, ‘hospitality’ and ‘hotels’ and ‘tourism’. Searches focused on material relating to Europe, available in English from around 2003 (when the relevant UN protocol entered into force)<sup>2</sup>. A small amount of material was identified from other geographical regions in subject-matter which was underrepresented in European literature, such as good practice in social work from the USA. Inevitably, there is overlap with work on forced labour and other types of exploitation (which sometimes, though not always coincide with incidents of trafficking), however all attempts were made to differentiate the factors relating primarily to trafficking.

Material is available which originates from a range of countries, including the Netherlands, Belgium, UK, Czech Republic, Finland, Romania, Scotland and Ireland, and regions such as South-Eastern Europe, Eastern Europe and the EU.

---

<sup>1</sup> For example, UK is primarily a ‘*destination*’ country for trafficked people though may also be a transit ‘stop off’, eg, for France; Romania is a ‘*source*’ country for trafficking, with Romanian men women and children exploited throughout Europe; it is also a ‘*target*’ or ‘*destination*’ for women from Moldavia, Russia and Ukraine for sexual exploitation; and a ‘*transit*’ country through which trafficked people are moved; Finland is a destination country, primarily where women from adjacent eastern and southern regions are brought to sell sexual services as well as a transit country (Viuhko, M, 2010; Drumea, 2011; NCA, 2014).

<sup>2</sup> United Nations Protocol against Trafficking in Persons, 2003.

### 3. Background

Individuals are trafficked for a wide range of activities. Globally, the majority of trafficking victims are subjected to sexual exploitation, and this is also the case in Europe. Detection of other forms of exploitation are steadily increasing, including for: domestic servitude with low or no pay; other types of labour exploitation such as legal work in catering and restaurants, agriculture or charity bag collecting or illegal work such as cannabis cultivation or drug dealing; and forced marriage. Recent EU figures show women account for 67% of registered victims, men for 17%, girls for 13% and boys for 3% (EUROSTAT, 2014). Children are trafficked for forced labour, such as begging and theft (which may include shoplifting and pocket-picking) with common 'combinations' for women of sexual exploitation alongside labour such as cleaning or waitressing. The manner of exploitation may change as the victims grow older, for example, being used for begging when young, then transferred to prostitution when older (Surtees, 2008; Lazar, 2011; Drumea, 2011; Kalayaan, 2013; UNODC, 2014; NCA, 2014).

Forced Labour is defined by the ILO as "all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered himself voluntarily"<sup>3</sup>. Those subjected to forced labour may also experience violence, coercion such as debt bonding, excessive dependence on employers or other third parties and exploitative practices such as excessive working hours or substandard accommodation (Wright and Pollert, 2005).

Reporting from EU member states notes a prevalence of victims of trafficking for the purposes of labour exploitation associated with the hotel/restaurant/catering sector (EUROSTAT, 2014; Dutch National Rapporteur on THB and Sexual Violence Against Children, 2014). The hospitality sector is particularly susceptible to abusive labour practices for a number of reasons. Firstly to keep costs low and remain competitive, responsibility for employing staff has been increasingly fractionalised with many hotels buying in agency workers, even contracting out an entire function – such as housekeeping - rather than directly employing their own staff. The provision of unskilled labour, such as cleaning, is particularly open to abuse, partly because it does not require authentic paperwork and certification required for skilled workers such as trained chefs. There is also evidence of price competition between agencies driving down wages, leading to documented, in-house staff being replaced with cheaper, undocumented workers, or those with insecure or irregular immigration status. These workers are more defenceless in the face of unethical practices, as they may lack understanding of their rights or be more fearful about coming forward (ILO, 2010; Wilkinson et al, 2010; Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2013). Some argue that these abuses are widespread across the hospitality sector, and that isolated incidences of abuse which surface in the press from time-to-time "fail to reflect ... the structural, systematic exploitation endemic in the hotel industry" (Wilkinson et al, p54). Moreover, trade union density is low in the sector, for reasons including the number of seasonal, part-time and casual workers, high staff turnover and a lack of knowledge of union activity (Wright and Pollert, 2005; Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2013).

---

<sup>3</sup> International Labour Organization (ILO) (2015). *International Labour Standards on Forced Labour*, <http://www.ilo.org/global/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/forced-labour/lang--en/index.htm> [Accessed 17/8/2015].

Furthermore, changes in the sector have meant that large hotel chains now mainly managed rather than owned, placing an onus on maximising contracts, all of which increases the pressure on cost (ILO, 2010). This leads to less clarity around who holds employer responsibilities, and increasing chances for informality which may lead to exploitation as the relationship becomes more removed from hotel itself (Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2013). Within smaller businesses issues can be exacerbated by a lack of awareness of employee's rights (TUC Commission on Vulnerable Employment, 2007).

A number of 'push' factors have led to a noted increase in cross-border movements over recent years, including inequality and poverty, unemployment and poor economic conditions, inadequate health and education systems and environmental degradation as well as war or civil unrest. All of these factors can motivate individuals toward traffickers. Roby (2005) identifies a second set of micro-factors, including family breakdown or abuse in the home particularly affecting women and children. 'Pull' factors towards 'destination' countries include affluence and large sex markets (domestic or for tourists) (Shelley, 2014). A further 'pull' factor is the need for flexible, mobile, temporary and low cost labour to fuel consumer demand. This need is often met by foreign workers, whom in countries such as the UK are considered hard-working and willing to work anti-social hours (Wilkinson et al, 2010).

Europe has a greater variety in the national origins of trafficking victims than any other part of the world. Belgium, Germany, Greece, Italy and the Netherlands have recorded the highest number of trafficking victims within Europe. People are brought in from all regions of the world, with primary transit routes being across the Mediterranean, through the Balkans, Eastern Europe and Turkey (often tracing routes for traded goods). Austria, Denmark, France, Spain and Switzerland are the next largest hubs, and large immigrant populations, ports and extensive coastlines all facilitate entry. Historical and political connections, and social and religious ties, perhaps relating to former colonial structures between sending and receiving countries are also identified as factors influencing flows of people. Routes of travel can be complex, involving movement across several national borders, and traffickers adapt these where necessary, eg, switching from boat to land travel following tightening of maritime controls. The 'configuration' of travel also varies in an attempt to avoid suspicion, with some travelling in groups and others as individuals with 'handlers' throughout. Some victims are also exploited at various locations during transit (Antonopoulos and Winterdyk, 2006; Surtees, 2008; Parmentier, 2010; Shelley, 2014).

#### *4. The hospitality sector in context*

The hospitality sector is particularly vulnerable to trafficking and associated forced/exploited labour practices for several reasons. Firstly, the sector is highly dependent on low-skilled, migrant, flexible labour to deal with seasonal fluctuation in demand, with organisations particularly at risk being those using agency staff or in outsourced staffing operations. This is exacerbated by the highly competitive nature of the industry, which creates constant pressure to drive down costs. Higher-risk organisations are those operating in an area known for sex tourism, with indications that risk increases large events such as the World Cup, which lead to both a need for short-term labour and also greater demand for sexual services (International Tourism Partnership, 2013; Rowntree Foundation, 2013).

In addition to a moral obligation to ensure that children and adults are not exploited within or by their business, the impetus for the sector to address these issues is high. Motivating

factors include the risk to reputation and profit associated with involvement in trafficking (even unwittingly) and increasing legislative pressure such as requirements for supply chain transparency in the USA. Furthermore, greater awareness of the prevalence of trafficking has led to more shareholders and other stakeholders requesting evidence of anti-trafficking policies, and addressing these offers positive benefits to build a brand around ethical and good human rights practices (International Tourism Partnership, 2013).

#### 5. *Data collection*

Measuring the extent of human trafficking poses a number of challenges, though it is important to attempt to do so to monitor change and the impact of policies and interventions (ILO, 2014). The covert nature of trafficking means measuring or estimating it is inherently difficult. Key issues identified with data collection are:

- *Data recording* – categories might differ across sources and some individuals suffer multiple exploitation, for example, they may be exploited for labour then used to claim benefits once an employment letter has been obtained from an employment agency (NCA, 2014).
- *Unwillingness to disclose experiences*, cooperate with law enforcement or consent to have their data recorded, either because they do not consider themselves as exploited (possibly viewing their situation as temporary) or they may feel complicit in their situation and therefore fearful of deportation or arrest (Surtees, 2008; Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2013; NCA, 2014).
- *Victims are not identified as potential trafficking victims* because they are considered to be working voluntarily, for example, as sex-workers, identified as criminals or considered immigration offenders, which may occur if they have been provided with false or stolen identity documents (NCA, 2014).

Furthermore, worldwide research commissioned by ILO (2014) demonstrated that most victims escaping from forced labour or trafficking return to their home without requesting assistance and are therefore not counted.

UNODC warn that where official data relates to what has been detected, it is clear that reported numbers “are only the tip of the iceberg” (UNODC, 2014, p1).

#### 6. *Difficulties with policing and law enforcement*

UNODC report very low conviction rates for traffickers (2014), in part, because the crime is difficult to detect. Victims may be easily concealed, for example, in households where they are being exploited in domestic servitude. Unlike other crimes, where victims and witnesses represent the main source of evidence, many victims do not self-identify as trafficked, and when identified as ‘trafficked’ by the authorities will often abscond possibly because of mistrust of police, fear of deportation or fear of reprisal against themselves or their family. There are also numerous examples of trafficked persons facing prosecution, including minors trafficked to work on British cannabis farms, which may also cause victims to avoid the authorities (Jackson et al, 2010; Lebov, 2010; The Centre for Social Justice, 2013).

Coghlan and Whyllie (2011) highlight further difficulty with detecting trafficked people: that the complexity of different migration experiences is such that ‘neat divisions’ do not exist and

some people who have been exploited still “do not tick all the trafficking boxes” from a legal viewpoint (p1516). As many migrants are “on a ‘continuum of exploitation’ between the poles of regular work with rights and remuneration and trafficking rigorously defined” (p1518) they do not satisfy the full legal definition and lack access to state protection.

Furthermore, as evidence suggests that women and children are trafficked most often, those on the ground may be less likely to recognise other types of people, such as young men, as victims of trafficking. It is maintained that such lack of awareness has led to a failure to recognise victims within law enforcement, social services, frontline staff and the judicial system (Balch and Geddes, 2011; The Centre for Social Justice, 2013).

In addition, victims may be moved legally across borders, but can be unaware that they are being trafficked. They may have initially been complicit in that movement to obtain employment and unaware of any intention to exploit them. Because of this they may willingly accept coaching to deceive border officials and law enforcement officers during their journey, for example, declaring themselves as tourists to give the impression of legality. Equally, those trafficked illicitly with false, or no documentation to avoid detection may subsequently be reluctant to contact the authorities because of their lack of legal status, or flee rather than accept support or accommodation when this requires involvement with any authorities. They may also lack confidence in law enforcement, because of previous experiences of corruption in authorities (Stephen-Smith and Edwards, 2008; Surtees, 2008; Lebov, 2010).

Some victims may also be highly traumatised, so unwilling or unable to give any useful detail on their experience or those who trafficked them. Others may wish to remain in the country to which they have been trafficked and be exploited rather than return to their previous existence, in the absence of a viable economic alternative (Kelly, 2002, in Surtees, 2008; Lebov, 2010).

Studies have also identified a number of obstacles to effective cross-border cooperation, which include inadequate communication and information-sharing; limited transnational intelligence-gathering; limited witness protection programmes; a lack of harmonised definitions and penalties for human trafficking; and inadequately harmonised law enforcement and judicial processes such as rules for evidence-gathering, extradition agreements and alternatives to live-witness testimony. There may also be conflicting priorities between organisations offering support, such as NGOs who need to gain trust of the trafficked persons, and the needs of law enforcement (Surtees 2008; Lebov, 2010). Furthermore, Parmentier, (2010) argues that such high levels of criminal activity across the EU indicate some collusion with lawful authorities, and this warrants further investigation. Poelmans et al, (2012) devised and successfully test an ‘early warning’ system based on police intelligence to profile and identify traffickers, based on behavioural and other characteristics which included possession of large amounts of money and perpetrating violence.

Key factors to successful initiatives have been identified as including: cooperation and coordination between governmental bodies, NGOs and law enforcement; a focus on both state and local agencies; specialised training for personnel ‘on the ground’ to both recognise and report victims immediately, eg, assisting police officers in identifying trafficked individuals and recognising others who might identify them such as medical personal, social welfare or educational institutions; including self-reporting mechanisms such as hotlines;

providing a set of indicators to facilitate identification and entitlement to support; central monitoring such as a referral structure; referral to medical, psychological and legal services (Lazar, 2011).

### *7. Trafficking 'methods'*

Traffickers' methods ensure that many victims are unlikely to come forward. Initial recruitment methods are often to exert psychological pressure, for example, through abuse of economic vulnerability or exploitation of family ties, a friendship or loving – even intimate - relationship which can often lead to victims feeling dependent on the perpetrator. Traffickers exploit limited employment opportunities or existing debt by promising legitimate employment (sometimes via the internet or mass-media advertisements). This may mirror the work offered by legitimate agencies, and can involve legal documentation to avoid suspicion and cover the intended exploitation. Other recruitment techniques include promises of marriage or engagement, or with offers of help such as entry to a rehabilitation programme or financial assistance for medical operations which can increase dependency (Surtees, 2008; Lazar, 2011; Dutch National Rapporteur on THB and Sexual Violence Against Children, 2014).

Moreover, some victims' movement and social interaction is controlled, giving them limited opportunities to disclose their situation. They may have been moved from site-to-site - which is common for women being sexually exploited - to both isolate them from any sources of support and help avoid police detection. Other common ways of maintaining control are violence, confiscating documentation, such as passports, debt bonding, being forced to repay large 'arrangement' fees threats to the victim's family, along with poor living and working conditions (Surtees, 2008; NCA, 2014; Lebov, 2010). Leman and Janssens (2008) identify more 'professional' trafficking organisations who allow women some agency and are more 'humane' which generates them greater profit as less resource is required to exert control, and the trafficked individuals become more amenable. In any case, some victims, particularly sex-workers, may be reluctant to return to their countries of origin because they might face discrimination, and child victims may be rejected by their family or community on return. If victims fear deportation or arrest these fears have often been reinforced by their traffickers (Surtees, 2008; Lazar, 2011; Lebov, 2010).

### *8. Organisations and networks*

Some of the available research studies focus on the organisational structures used by traffickers, and demonstrate the different networks which facilitate their activities. The increased use of labour market intermediaries (which, as outlined elsewhere is becoming more prevalent in the hospitality industry), is identified as correlating with greater labour exploitation. Labour supply chains which are vulnerable to forced labour because of sector-specific conditions may find this has worked its way into legitimate supply chains (Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2013; ILO, 2014). Whilst much activity is organised by criminal groups, for example, in South-East Europe, other research has identified independent individuals who link into wider networks for transportation, the movement of money, etc (Icduygu, 2004; Surtees, 2008). Leman and Janssens (2008), contend that the financial modus operandi of trafficking networks is under-researched and they identify 'profiles' in the structure of the criminal network for trafficking into Belgium from Eastern Europe. They describe traffickers' relationships which are based on trust and reciprocal dependency. The



relationships and networks can range from smaller 'family and clan'-based organisations 'recruiting' local women to, increasingly, more complex business structures. The latter may be larger, transnational, contain inter-ethnic groups, include the absorption of other organisations to facilitate trafficking such as travel agencies and recruit from a number of countries.

Surtees (2008) argues that it is not possible to solve the problem of human trafficking without understanding who traffickers are and how they operate, the opportunities which allow for trafficking and their organisational methods. This can provide measures to deter and prosecute them. Leman and Janssens (2008) further contend that it is necessary to understand criminal networks in their entirety to combat them, and focus on profiles and the way the networks are managed. Studies found, for example, that different nationalities specialise in particular 'types' of trafficking, for example, Bulgarian and Albanian groups were identified as trafficking women for prostitution, and that victims have often been found to be recruited by someone of their own nationality (though there is also a great deal of transnational cooperation) (Cejp, 2008; Surtees, 2008).

Although there is often a typical image of a middle-aged man, unknown to the victim, in reality traffickers are much more diverse. This might lead to potential victims being less suspicious when the perpetrators do not conform to the stereotype (Alexandru and Lazaroiu, 2003, in Surtees, 2008). Research in some localities, for example, has shown that a growing number of women are involved in trafficking as perpetrators, and globally, women offenders are more prevalent (around 30%) than in most other types of crime. They are often involved in the sexual exploitation of other women, for instance the procurement of individuals for sexual exploitation. At times this can be unintentional, for example, victims who are encouraged to invite their friends to work abroad. Other perpetrators are former or current victims who are coerced into compliance, and there is evidence that many convicted traffickers are former victims. Male/female couples may also work together as traffickers, recognising and capitalising on the fact that young migrants may be more inclined to trust a woman (Cejp, 2008; Surtees, 2008; Lazar, 2011; Shelley, 2014).

#### *9. Medical issues and THB*

Although limited, most of the research to date on the health of trafficked persons is based on women and sexual exploitation. Zimmerman et al (2003) identify key stages of the trafficking 'journey' and the health conditions which prevail, for example, broken bones from physical abuse whilst travelling, or HIV and other STIs contracted whilst performing sex work. Zimmerman et al (2008), interviewing women and adolescent girls in post-trafficking services found that 95% had been subjected to physical or sexual violence whilst trafficked, and had multiple physical and psychological problems. Di Tommaso et al, (2009), who studied the well-being of women trafficked for sexual exploitation, found that easier access to medical care was the highest influencer of well-being. Some literature considers assessment and after-care of trafficked people, with studies addressing the psychological and physical health needs of trafficking victims. Busch-Armendariz et al (2014) identify the unique needs of trafficked persons, including trauma-informed mental health services. McIntyre (2014) emphasises the importance of urgent and comprehensive medical checks when assessing the needs of child survivors, which should include the appropriate medical training to conduct complex examinations in a sensitive way.

Research on the health of those trafficked for labour exploitation is very limited. Turner-Moss et al (2014) report that a substantial proportion of those trafficked for this purpose may experience violence and abuse, have physical and mental health problems (anxiety, depression and post-traumatic stress disorder - PTSD) and need access to medical assessment and treatment. Zimmerman et al (2003) identify that PTSD may render victims incapable of reflecting on or disclosing their experiences for some time.

Related to medical issues is the trafficking of organs. Though EUROSTAT (2014) show that this is not an issue in the EU, others describe a shadow economy which includes Eastern European victims and money moved through bank accounts in Cyprus and Italy (Scheper-Hughes, 2011), whilst Lundin, (2012) describes an ethnographic study of organ trafficking victims close by in Moldova. Efrat, (2014) emphasises the importance of the medical profession mobilising for action against the organ trade, to establish international norms, transform professional practice and place it on the political agenda thereby influencing governments in effecting policy change.

### *10. Women and children*

Trafficking in women is often regarded as a form of gender violence. The literature addressing women and trafficking focuses mainly on trafficking for forced prostitution and sexual exploitation, and the wider, global 'sex tourism' industry. Europe is the final destination of many trafficked women for sexual purposes around the world (Roby, 2005), and this may be in brothels, bars, nightclubs, cafés, the streets, massage parlours, saunas, through escort agencies, hotels or private homes. Trafficking for sexual exploitation can also occur in hotels and restaurants (which double as brothels) (Annison, 2013). These might change according to the differing attentions of law enforcement, for example, or if the perpetrators become more organised (Lebov, 2010; IDMG 2012). The literature also explores intersections such as class inequality, ethnicity, exploitation, social marginalisation and migration, all of which can add to women's vulnerability (Hughes, 2004; Modupe-Oluwa Baye and Heumann, 2014; Berman, 2003, Papanicolaou, 2008; Pajnik and Renault, 2014). Three dimensions of sex trafficking can be woven together: commercial sex as violence against women, as a livelihood option and as part of the social formation of an interstate system of transaction of sex as a commodity (Truong, 2003). Disempowerment of women as well as capitalism and free market ideology are seen as inherent components of the increase of trafficking, and this is also linked to women's unequal position in former state socialist countries (Haynes, 2010; Suchland, 2013).

Different national backgrounds are used as case studies to explore policy approaches. The Swedish Law that prohibits the purchase of sexual services and that aims to address the root cause of prostitution and THB is discussed as a model that reduces the flow of trafficked persons into Sweden (Ekberg, 2004). The concept of global prohibition regimes is an analytical point of departure for several papers (Papanicolaou, 2008). Following an international and global approach of trafficking in human beings, the European Union is often required to take active action on sex trafficking (Truong, 2003). Policies especially focus on granting adequate protection and support to those who fall victim – especially women and children - and on the prosecution of the criminals involved in trafficking through international conventions and protocols. There is also exploration of ways to avoid the stigmatisation and the relegation of migrant women to the status of victims paying more attention to the broader setting in which the exploitation of migrants takes place (Askola,

2007; Cree, 2008; Isgro et al, 2013). Some literature investigates strategies for reduction in demand for sexual services, addressing UN peacekeepers and other deployed troops (Allred, 2006).

The active role of 'marriage agencies' in the trafficking in women - especially in the former Soviet Union - is also analysed (Hughes, 2004), along with the involvement of criminal networks, transnational organised crime and the recruitment strategies (Johansson Wennerholm, 2002; Petrunov, 2011; Papanicolaou, 2008). Also, Bovenkerk and van San (2011) demonstrate that although the 'loverboy' phenomenon, ie, pimps who use seductive skills to exploit young women for prostitution has been seen by some as a 'moral panic', they found evidence in the Netherlands of a "new type of pimp" organising and overseeing trafficking women from rural villages mainly using the internet (p198). Young women were often reluctant to recognise the relationship as exploitative.

Representation of trafficking in the media is also addressed by some academic analysis with critiques of the portrayal of women. Bovenkerk and van San (2011), for example, identified the glamorisation of relationships between pimps and 'their girls' through US-dominated television and movie images. Stiles, (2012) is critical of campaign materials which portray trafficked women as lacking agency, advocating that these should always show their "depth of character" as real people (p201).

The trafficking of children is often addressed alongside young women being forced into prostitution. Some analysis is critical of this focus arguing that it sustains a 'moral panic' which keeps attention away from wider concerns about exploited labour and other aspects of trafficking (Alvarez and Alessi, 2012). Nevertheless, it remains the focus of campaigning. Tepelus, (2008) identifies good practice in the global tourism industry to deal with child exploitation, which includes raising awareness, and creating incentives to report sex tourism and trafficking.

### *11. Victim support*

Trafficking victims in the EU are entitled to assistance and support, such as medical treatment, safe accommodation, etc, once the competent authorities have reasonable grounds to believe they have been trafficked. They also have rights to protection where they are involved in criminal proceedings against their traffickers, for example, when giving evidence, and whilst in residence other support relating to their circumstances such as medical care (Lebov, 2010; EU, 2013).

Van Selm, (2013) and The Centre for Social Justice, (2013) identify the importance of integration for migrants. The rights of trafficked individuals may depend on a number of factors, including their willingness to participate in the prosecution of those who abused them meaning their stability is fragile. Van Selm's (2013) study across Belgium, France, Hungary, Italy and the UK identifies the importance of appropriate reflection periods to provide survivors with security and time to think through their willingness to take part in prosecution proceedings; dedicated support officers and sufficient information (in their own language). Appropriate shelter with links to psycho-social report were singled out as key, as were special interrogation techniques and support from a psychologist or other professional for children to prevent secondary victimisation and there are also recommendations that help is

provided to secure compensation such as unpaid wages (Simeunovic-Patic and Copic, 2010; Kalayaan, 2013).

There is limited work available from Europe relating to good practice in systems and mechanisms to protect victims. However, there is a range of work from a social work practitioner's viewpoint from the USA. McIntyre (2014) draws on global experience with child victims, and identifies a need to understand victim's individual narrative along with the details of their family and community to help with healing. Okech et al, (2011) emphasise the importance of victim identification and the role of first-line responders who come into contact with them supported by public education and outreach about warning signs, their rights and available resources.

### *12. Hotels and hospitality research*

There is little academic material around this sector in relation to trafficking, though some policy documentation highlights areas where the hospitality sector might facilitate trafficking. Globally, UNODC (2014) identify catering and restaurants as areas where forced labour has steadily increased in recent years, and there is further evidence that sectors such as hospitality which rely heavily on seasonal or temporary staff are more likely to use forced or bonded labour (Andrees, 2008; House of Commons, 2009; Aronowitz et al, 2010; Lebov, 2010; Shelley, 2014). Factors identified as contributing to high levels of exploitation include: work permit requirements which prevent movement out of exploitative situations; lack of labour inspection and/or enforcing employment standards; negative perceptions of hotel work which mean it is more likely to attract migrant labour; increasing the length and complexity of supply chains which include agency labour; and low trade union representation (Coghlan and Whyllie, 2011; Centre for the Study of International Slavery, 2014).

Hotels may be used for the purpose of child exploitation and grooming, and those in the tourism industry, who may come into contact with victims, are identified as potential 'first responders' for identifying victims (NCA, 2014; The Walk Free Foundation, 2014). In the UK, for example, the National Crime Agency states that 4% (44 individuals) of sexual exploitation took place in hotels and these may also be used for grooming and child exploitation though this goes unidentified. A proportion of those sexually exploited in hotels (18) were also exploited at multiple locations in the UK, showing that they were being trafficked internally. There are, however, difficulties inherent in identifying exploitation in hotels and other residences – because they are 'private' areas - so there is uncertainty that the figures available reflect the true scale of abuse taking place (NCA, 2014).

Viuhko's (2010) study in Finland on how trafficking and procurement of women is organised concentrated on hotel personnel, finding that the internet was the most commonly-used method of marketing services and that a network of intermediaries (apartment owners, restaurant staff, hotel and travel agency employees, taxi drivers, etc) support and facilitate activities, sometimes unknowingly.

### *13. Guidance for the hospitality industry*

A selection of guidelines has been provided, specifically aimed at the industry. The Children's Society (undated), for example, have produced a training pack on their 'Say Something if you See Something' campaign aimed at the hotel trade. This includes indicators for reception staff, eg, young people checking in with older males, and for other

staff such as housekeeping, who are asked to look for high traffic in rooms or signs of drug-taking and excessive sexual activity. Balch and Rankin (2014) developed guidelines for hotels to protect themselves against THB and exploited labour. These advocate key principles for developing good practice, such as considering human trafficking and labour exploitation in corporate social responsibility plans, and also explore frameworks for reporting, monitoring and staff engagement.

The International Tourism Partnership (undated) stresses the importance of having a 'position statement' and also published a 'Know How Guide' (2013) for the hotel industry, which includes guidelines on engaging staff, reporting on activities, identifying their own risk areas and developing an action plan. The guidelines encourage the establishment of assessing risks then putting a reporting and management structure in place to mitigate these. Policies, including hiring and supplier codes of conduct should define trafficking and express zero-tolerance for these practices. Good practice examples of this type of policy include Marriott Hotels, whose 'Supplier Conduct Principles' outline their expectations for accuracy and honesty in all transactions along with maintaining ethical standards (Marriott, 2012). Other good practice includes hotel companies which build clauses into supplier contracts requiring compliance with their anti-trafficking policies. Furthermore, a number of industry stakeholders have produced educational programs for hoteliers explaining the role hospitality can play in combatting child trafficking and sexual exploitation (Rice, 2014).

The 'Staff Wanted Initiative'<sup>4</sup> promotes understanding of the legal risk to businesses and advocates the 'SEE FORMULA' – **S**crutinise through monitoring relationships with staff and agencies; **E**ngage with the workforce; **E**nsure a fit and proper workplace is provided – for hotels to protect their businesses (Staff Wanted Initiative, 2015). International Tourism Partnership (2013a) also provide guidelines for checking recruitment agencies, detailing background checks to be run on an agency's credentials, questions to ask about their practices and codes of conduct, assessments on terms and conditions for agency staff (ie, whether these match those of directly-employed staff) and a periodic checklist around fees, contracts, document-checking and questions to ask of the staff themselves.

Other good practice advice includes: developing specific programs to address human trafficking in human right policies drawing on nationally-agreed definitions to create common understanding; ensuring these extend to responsible hiring practices; utilising human rights impact assessments to identify trafficking risks; educating staff on workers' rights and how to report incidents; transparency in the supply chain through the audit process; disclosure through public reporting; joining with local groups and global networks to share knowledge and best practice. In addition, it is important to provide support for employees and develop their awareness about the benefits of union membership (CBIS, 2012; International Tourism Partnership, 2013; Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2013).

Other guidelines, which are non-sector specific may nevertheless hold useful information for the hospitality industry, for example, UK charity Unseen (undated) provides a list of 'indicators' of the signs of trafficked people such as whether they seem fearful or are not in possession of their own identity documents.

---

<sup>4</sup> This initiative is managed in partnership by Anti-Slavery International and The Institute for Human Rights and Business <http://www.staff-wanted.org/about/>

#### *14. Wider policy change*

The research identified contains a number of suggestions to improve the situation for trafficked persons. Several studies identify a tension between the rights-based approach to trafficking specified by, for example, the Council of Europe Convention and immigration policies around selection and an economic rationale which are in opposition to the requirement to recognise and protect victims of trafficking (Balch and Geddes, 2011). Okech et al, (2014) argue that defining trafficking as a crime, rather than a human rights violation affects how its victims and perpetrators are perceived, and therefore the intervention policies in place. Coghlan and Whyllie (2011) argue for focusing on migrants' rights and to "place an ethical concern with exploitation at the heart of the response [to trafficking]" (p1524).

Suggestions for priorities are to harmonize laws, decrease profits by focusing on the financial aspects, improve labour laws, and address demand through education, prevention and prosecution; target consumers and businesses through raising awareness to change buying behaviour, which in turn will bring about change, for example, greater control of product supply chains to eradicate exploited labour (Shelley, 2014).

On a more localised level, Mantouvalou (2010) stresses the importance of civil society groups in supporting the courts and legislature to take positive steps in addressing gross injustices. There was some evidence that holistic services, which offer victims support over and above accommodation only, help to address issues of victims leaving accommodation or failing to give evidence against their traffickers (Lebov, 2010). Furthermore, training on the risks of trafficking is recommended for social workers as part of both standard qualifications and continuing professional development (The Centre for Social Justice, 2013).

One tool for combating exploitative labour within the UK lies in The Gangmasters (Licensing) Act, introduced in 2004, which established the Gangmasters Licensing Authority, to set standards around pay, conditions and good treatment of workers with criminal penalties for non-compliance. This scheme extends to labour suppliers in a number of sectors which are susceptible to worker exploitation, particularly because of their high use of temporary, foreign labour such as agriculture and food-processing. However, although the hospitality sector is subject to some of these factors, the Act does not extend this far, meaning that the sector is subject to less vigorous enforcement of employment regulation and making it more open to abuse by unscrupulous gangmasters. Moreover, incidents have been reported of abusive gangmasters deliberately moving into sectors not covered by the Act to avoid prosecution. This is likely to include hospitality, and there are indications that this is the case resulting in higher levels of abusive practices (TUC Commission on Vulnerable Employment, 2007; Wilkinson et al, 2010; Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2013). Within the UK several agencies have called for an extension of the Act to incorporate the hospitality and catering sectors, which would help with the closure of exploitative agencies, though this does not appear to be on the government's agenda (Institute for Human Rights and Business, 2010; Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2013).

#### *15. Future research*

A number of areas for future research on THB have been identified within existing academic literature. These include: a need for alternative data-collection methodologies; greater understanding of the 'geography of human trafficking' and therefore the phenomenon,

through the production of more reliable figures on numbers of trafficking victims, their characteristics – gender, age, geographical origin, etc; and countries of origin; testing and exploration of theoretical models to better explain and predict trafficking, and how to build capacity within and between nations (Surtees, 2008; Parmentier, 2010; Winterdyk and Reichel, 2010). Output from the COMBAT project will both contribute to the academic debate and evidence-based policy development on THB in all these areas as they relate to tourism and hospitality, to inform ongoing policy and strategy in a meaningful way.

## Bibliography

- Alvarez, M. and Alessi, E. 2012. Human Trafficking is More than Sex Trafficking and Prostitution: Implications for Social Work, *Journal of Women and Social Work*, 27(2) 142-152
- Andrees, B. (2008). *Forced labour and trafficking in Europe: how people are trapped in, live through and come out*, International Labour Office,  
[http://wiki.lewman.is/files/ILO\\_Working\\_paper\\_Forced\\_labour\\_and\\_trafficking\\_in\\_Europe.pdf](http://wiki.lewman.is/files/ILO_Working_paper_Forced_labour_and_trafficking_in_Europe.pdf), [Accessed 9 January 2015]
- Annison, R. (2013). *In the Dock. Examining the UK's Criminal Justice Response to Trafficking*, Anti-Trafficking Monitoring Group  
[http://www.antislavery.org/includes/documents/cm\\_docs/2013/i/in\\_the\\_dock\\_final.pdf](http://www.antislavery.org/includes/documents/cm_docs/2013/i/in_the_dock_final.pdf) [Accessed 10 January 2015]
- Antonopoulos, G. A. Winterdyk, J. (2006). The Smuggling of Migrants in Greece. An Examination of its Social Organisation, *European Journal of Criminology*, 3(4), pp. 439-461
- Aronowitz, A. Theuermann, G. and Tyurykanova, E. (2010). *Analysing the business model of trafficking in human beings to better prevent the crime*,  
<http://www.osce.org/files/documents/c/f/69028.pdf>, OSCE, [Accessed 9 January 2015]
- Askola, H. (2007). Violence against Women. Trafficking, and Migration in the European Union, *European Law Journal*, Vol. 13, No. 2 pp.204-217
- Balch, A. and Geddes, A. (2011). Opportunity from Crisis? Organisational Responses to Human Trafficking in the UK, *The British Journal of Politics and International Relations*, Vol 13, 26-41
- Balch, A. and Rankin, G. (2014). *UK Hotels Policy Guide: How to protect your business against human trafficking, forced labour and labour exploitation*, Liverpool: Centre for the Study of International Slavery,  
[http://www.liv.ac.uk/media/livacuk/publicpolicypractice/12p\\_booklet.pdf](http://www.liv.ac.uk/media/livacuk/publicpolicypractice/12p_booklet.pdf) [Accessed 8 December 2014]
- Berman, J. (2003). (Un)Popular Strangers and Crises (Un)Bounded: Discourses of Sex-Trafficking, the European Political Community and the Panicked State of the Modern State, *European Journal of International Relations*, Vol. 9(1): 37-86
- Bovenkerk, F. and van San, M. (2011). Loverboys in the Amsterdam Red Light District: A Realist Approach the Study of Moral Panic, *Crime, Media, Culture* 7: 185-199
- Busch-Armendariz, N. Busch Nsonwu, M. and Cook Heffron, L. (2014). A kaleidoscope: The role of the social work practitioner and the strength of social work theories and practice in meeting the complex needs of people trafficked and the professionals that work with them, *International Social Work*, *International Social Work*, Vol 57(1) 7-18
- CBIS (2012). Corporate Strategies to Address Human Trafficking. Investor Recommendations for London Olympic Sponsors and Hospitality Companies, [http://cbisonline.com/us/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2012/09/FINAL\\_OlympicsReport\\_9\\_28.pdf](http://cbisonline.com/us/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2012/09/FINAL_OlympicsReport_9_28.pdf) [Accessed 24/8/2015].
- Cejp, M. (2008). *Criminological research into organised crime in the Czech Republic*,  
[http://www.bka.de/nn\\_192960/EN/SubjectsAZ/Research/OrganisedCrimeResearch/2008/organisedCrimeResearch2008\\_node.html?\\_nn=true](http://www.bka.de/nn_192960/EN/SubjectsAZ/Research/OrganisedCrimeResearch/2008/organisedCrimeResearch2008_node.html?_nn=true), [Accessed 15 December 2014]



- Coghlan, D. and Wylie, G. (2011). Defining Trafficking/Denying Justice? Forced Labour in Ireland and the Consequences of Trafficking Discourse, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol. 37, No. 9, November 2011, pp. 1513-1526
- Craig, G. (2014). Modern slavery in the UK: the contribution of research, *Journal of Poverty and Social Justice*, Vol 22, no 2, 159-64
- Cree, V. (2008). Confronting sex trafficking: Lessons from history, *International Social Work*, 51(6): 763-776
- Di Tommaso, M. L. Shima I. Strom S. Bettio F. (2009). As bad as it gets: Well-being deprivation of sexually exploited trafficked women, *European Journal of Political Economy* 25 (2009) 143-162
- Drumea, M. C. (2011). Stopping Forced Labour, *Economics, Management, and Financial Markets*, Volume 6(2), 2011, pp. 839-842
- Dutch National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings and Sexual Violence against Children (2014). *Trafficking in Human Beings: Visible and Invisible II. Summary of the quantitative report 2008 – 2012*, <http://www.dutchrapporteur.nl/current/news/archief/a-report-of-modern-forms-of-slavery-in-the-netherlands.data-on-human-trafficking-2008-2012.aspx?cp=64&cs=16855> [Accessed 15 December 2014]
- EFFAT (European Federation of Food, Agriculture and Tourism Trade Union) (2009). Social justice from farm to fork. Fight precarious work! EFFAT Charter on Precarious Work, available from <http://www.precarious-work.eu/> [Accessed 24/8/2015].
- Efrat, A. (2014). Professional socialization and international norms: Physicians against organ trafficking, *European Journal of International Relations*, Published online October 2, 2014, doi:10.1177/1354066114542664
- Ekberg, G. (2004). The Swedish Law the Prohibits the Purchase of Sexual Services: Best Practices for Prevention of Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings, *Violence Against Women*, Vol. 10 No. 10 1187-1218
- European Union (EU), (2013). *The EU rights of victims of trafficking in human beings*, [http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/e-library/docs/thb\\_victims\\_rights/thb\\_victims\\_rights\\_en.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/e-library/docs/thb_victims_rights/thb_victims_rights_en.pdf) [Accessed 3 February 2015]
- EUROSTAT (2014). *Trafficking in human beings. 2014 edition*, European Union Publications Office, [http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/what-is-new/news/news/docs/20141017\\_working\\_paper\\_on\\_statistics\\_on\\_trafficking\\_in\\_human\\_beings\\_en.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/what-is-new/news/news/docs/20141017_working_paper_on_statistics_on_trafficking_in_human_beings_en.pdf) [Accessed 8 December 2014]
- Haynes, D. (2010). Lessons from Bosnia's Arizona Market: harm to women in a neoliberalized postconflict reconstruction process, *University of Pennsylvania Law Review*, Vol. 158:1779
- House of Commons, Home Affairs Committee (2009). *The trade in human beings: human trafficking in the UK*, <http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm200809/cmselect/cmhaff/23/23i.pdf>, [Accessed 9 January 2015]
- Hughes, D. M. (2004). The Role of 'Marriage Agencies' in the Sexual Exploitation and Trafficking of Women from the Former Soviet Union, *International Review of Victimology*,

2004, Vol.11, pp.49-71

Icduygu, A. (2004). Transborder Crime between Turkey and Greece: Human Smuggling and its Regional Consequences, *Southeast European and Black Sea Studies*, Vol. 4, No. 2, pp. 294-314

Institute for Human Rights and Business (2010). The future of the Gangmasters Licensing Authority and the Employment Agencies Standards Inspectorate, [http://www.ihrb.org/pdf/Proposal-Future\\_of\\_the\\_Gangmasters\\_Licensing\\_Authority.pdf](http://www.ihrb.org/pdf/Proposal-Future_of_the_Gangmasters_Licensing_Authority.pdf) [Accessed 24/8/2015].

Inter-Departmental Ministerial Group (IDMG) (2012). *First annual report of the Inter-Departmental Ministerial Group on Human Trafficking*, [https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/118116/human-trafficking-report.pdf](https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/118116/human-trafficking-report.pdf) [Accessed 9 January 2015]

International Labour Office (ILO) (2014). *Profits and Poverty: The Economics of Forced Labour*, [http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms\\_243391.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_243391.pdf) [Accessed 28 January 2015]

International Labour Organization (2010) *The impact of new ownership of accommodation, operations and consumption on types of employment, industrial relations, HRD and qualification needs in the accommodation and hospitality sector*. Geneva: International Labour Organization.

International Tourism Partnership (2013). Know How Guide. Addressing Human Trafficking in the Hospitality Industry, *Green Hotelier*, <http://www.greenhotelier.org/know-how-guides/addressing-human-trafficking-in-the-hospitality-industry/> [Accessed 8 December 2014]

International Tourism Partnership (2013a). Guidelines for Checking Recruitment Agencies, July 2013, available via <http://tourismpartnership.org/human-trafficking/> [Accessed 24/8/2015].

International Tourism Partnership (undated). Human Trafficking Position Statement, available via <http://tourismpartnership.org/human-trafficking/> [Accessed 24/8/2015].

Jackson, K. Jeffery, J. and Adamson, G. (2010). *Setting the record: The trafficking of migrant women in England and Wales off-street prostitution sector*, Association of Chief Police Officers (ACPO), <http://www.acpo.police.uk/documents/crime/2010/201008CRITMW01.pdf>, [Accessed 9 December 2014]

Johansson Wennerholm, C. (2002). Crossing borders and building bridges: The Baltic Region Networking Project, *Gender and Development*, 10:1, 10-19

Joseph Rowntree Foundation (2013). *Forced Labour's Business Models and Supply Chains*. <http://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/forced-labour-regulation-full.pdf> [Accessed 15 December 2014]

Kalayaan (2013). *Slavery by another name: the tied migrant domestic worker visa*. <http://www.kalayaan.org.uk/documents/Slavery%20by%20a%20new%20name-%20Briefing%207.5.13.pdf> [Accessed 9 December 2014]

Lazar, I. (2011). Different forms of compensation available for damages caused to the victims of human trafficking, *Curentul Juridic*, 2011, vol. 46, pages 70-78

Lebov, K. (2010). Human Trafficking in Scotland, *European Journal of Criminology*, 7(1), 77-

- Leman, J. and Janssens, S. (2008). The Albanian and Post-Soviet Business of Trafficking Women for Prostitution, *European Journal of Criminology*, Vol 5 no 4. 433-451
- Lundin, S. (2012). Organ economy: organ trafficking in Moldova and Israel, *Public Understanding of Science*, 21(2), 226-241
- Mantouvalou, V. (2010). Modern Slavery: The UK Response, *Industrial Law Journal*, Vol. 39, No 4, December 2010
- Marriott (2012). Supplier Conduct Principles: Business Conduct and Ethics, [http://www.marriott.com/Multimedia/PDF/CorporateResponsibility/Marriott\\_Supplier\\_Conduct\\_Principles.pdf](http://www.marriott.com/Multimedia/PDF/CorporateResponsibility/Marriott_Supplier_Conduct_Principles.pdf) [Accessed 24/8/2015].
- McIntyre, B. L. (2014). More than just rescue: Thinking beyond exploitation to creating assessment strategies for child survivors of commercial sexual exploitation, *International Social Work*, 2014, Vol 57(1) 39-63
- Modupe-Oluwa Baye, E. and Heumann, S. (2014). Migration, Sex Work and Exploitative Labor Conditions: Experiences of Nigerian Women in the Sex Industry in Turin, Italy, and Counter-Trafficking Measures, *Gender, Technology and Development* 18 (1) 77-105
- National Crime Agency (NCA) (2014). *NCA Strategic Assessment. The Nature and Scale of Human Trafficking in 2013*, <http://www.nationalcrimeagency.gov.uk/publications/399-nca-strategic-assessment-the-nature-and-scale-of-human-trafficking-in-2013/file> [Accessed 8 December 2014
- Okech, D. Morreau, W. and Benson, K. (2011). Human trafficking: Improving victim identification and service provision, *International Social Work* 55(4) 488-503
- Pajnik, M. and Renault, M. (2014). The (re)making of sexualities on the web, *Social Science Information*, Vol. 53(4) 462-482
- Papanicolaou, G. (2008). The sex industry, human trafficking and the global prohibition regime: a cautionary tale from Greece, *Trends in Organised Crime* 11:379-409
- Parmentier, S. (2010). Epilogue: Human Trafficking Seen from the Future, *European Journal of Criminology* 7 (1) 95-100
- Petrunov, G. (2011). Managing money acquired from human trafficking: case study of sex trafficking from Bulgaria to Western Europe, *Trends in Organised Crime* 14:165-183
- Poelmans, J. Elzinga, P. Ignatov D. I. Kuznetsov, S. O. (2012). Semi-automated knowledge discovery: identifying and profiling human trafficking, *International Journal of General Systems*, Volume 41, Issue 8, pp774-804
- Rice, K. (2014). The war on human trafficking, *Travel Weekly*, May 07 2014, <http://www.travelweekly.com/Travel-News/Travel-Agent-Issues/The-war-on-human-trafficking/> Accessed 24/8/2015.
- Roby, J. L. (2005). Women and children in the global sex trade: Toward more effective policy, *International Social Work* 48 (2): 136-147
- Scheper-Hughes, N. (2011). Mr Tati's Holiday and Joao's Safari - Seeing the World through

Transplant Tourism, *Body & Society* Vol. 17(2&3); 55-92

Shelley, L. (2014). *Human smuggling and trafficking into Europe. A comparative perspective*, Transatlantic Council on Migration, <http://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/human-smuggling-and-trafficking-europe-comparative-perspective>, [Accessed 8 December 2014]

Simeunovic-Patic, B. and Copic, S. Protection and Assistance to Victims of Human Trafficking in Serbia: Recent Developments, *European Journal of Criminology* 7(1) 45-60

Staff Wanted Initiative (2015). Use the SEE FORMULA to help protect your business and those who work in it, <http://www.staff-wanted.org/see-formula/> [Accessed 24/8/2015].

Stephen-Smith, S. and Edwards, S. (2008). *Routes in, Routes out: quantifying the Gendered Experience of Trafficking to the UK*, The Poppy Project, [http://i1.cmsfiles.com/eaves/2012/04/Routes\\_In\\_Routes\\_Out-a1e7a1.pdf](http://i1.cmsfiles.com/eaves/2012/04/Routes_In_Routes_Out-a1e7a1.pdf) [Accessed 8 December 2014]

Stiles, S. (2012). 'I Am Elena': rhetorical analysis as the first step to a 'best practices' formula for sex trafficking Public Service Announcement, *Visual Communication* Vol 11(2)

Suchland, J. (2013). Double framing in Lilya 4-Ever: Sex trafficking and postsocial abjection, *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 16(3) 362-376

Surtees, R. (2008). Traffickers and Trafficking in Southern and Eastern Europe: Considering the Other Side of Human Trafficking, *European Journal of Criminology* 2008 5:39

Tepelus, C. (2008). Social Responsibility and Innovation on Trafficking and Child Sex Tourism: Morphing of Practice into Sustainable Tourism Policies?, *Tourism and Hospitality Research* 8, 98-115

The Centre for Social Justice (Slavery Working Group) (2013). *It happens here. Equipping the United Kingdom to fight modern slavery*, <http://www.centreforsocialjustice.org.uk/publications/it-happens-here-equipping-the-united-kingdom-to-fight-modern-slavery>, [Accessed 9 December 2014]

Truong, (2003). Gender, Exploitative Migration, and the Sex Industry: A European Perspective, *Gender, Technology and Development*, 7:31-52

TUC Commission on Vulnerable Employment, (2007). *Hard Work, Hidden Lives. The Full Report of the Commission on Vulnerable Employment*, [http://www.vulnerableworkers.org.uk/files/CoVE\\_full\\_report.pdf](http://www.vulnerableworkers.org.uk/files/CoVE_full_report.pdf) [Accessed 17/8/2015].

Turner-Moss, E. Zimmerman, C. Howard, L. M. Oram, S. (2014). Labour Exploitation and Health: A Case Series of Men and Women Seeking Post-Trafficking Services, *Journal of Immigrant Minority Health* (2014) 16:473-480

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) (2014). *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons 2014*, [http://www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/GLOTIP\\_2014\\_full\\_report.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/GLOTIP_2014_full_report.pdf) [Accessed 28 January 2015]

Van Selm, J. (2013). *Evaluation of the effectiveness of measures for the integration of trafficked persons*, International Organization for Migration, [http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/FIIT\\_study\\_ENG.pdf](http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/free/FIIT_study_ENG.pdf) [Accessed 3 February 2015]

Viuhko, M. (2010). Human Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation and Organized Procuring in

Finland, *European Journal of Criminology*, 7(1), 61-75

Wilkinson, M., Craig, G., and Gaus, A., (2010). *Forced labour in the UK and the Gangmasters Licensing Authority*, Hull: WISE Publications.

Winterdyk, J. and Reichel, P. (2010). Introduction to Special Issue. Human Trafficking: Issues and Perspectives, *European Journal of Criminology* 7(1) 5-10

Wright, T. and Pollert, A. (2005) *The experience of ethnic minority workers in the hotel and catering industry: Routes to support and advice on workplace: A review of the issues*. London: London Metropolitan University, [www.londonmet.ac.uk/library/e10423\\_3.pdf](http://www.londonmet.ac.uk/library/e10423_3.pdf) [Accessed 27/8/2015].

Zimmerman C. Yun K. Shvab I. Watts C. Trappolin L. (2003). *The Health Risks and Consequences of Trafficking in Women and Adolescents - Findings from a European Study*, <http://www.lshtm.ac.uk/php/ghd/docs/traffickingfinal.pdf> [Accessed 10 December 2014]

Zimmerman, C. Hossain, M. Yun, K. Gajdadziev, V. Guzun, N. Tchomarova, M. Ciarrocchi, R. A. Hohansson, A. Kefurtova, A. Scodanibbio, S. Motus, M. N. Roche, B. Morison, L. Watts, C. (2008). The health of trafficked women: a survey of women entering posttrafficking services in Europe. *American Journal of Public Health*, January 2008, Vol 98, No. 1.